UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI EASTERN DIVISION

In re: PATRIOT COAL CORP., et al.,	Chapter 11 Case No. 12-51502-659 Jointly Administered		
Debtor	GCG Claim No. 1261 EDMO Claim No. 779-1		

RESPONSE TO THE APRIL 18, 2014 OBJECTION OF THE REORGANIZED DEBTOR TO THE CLAIM OF CATHY WRIGHT, ADMINISTRATRIX FOR THE ESTATE OF NINA WRIGHT

Cathy Wright, administratrix for the Estate of Nina Wright, by her attorneys, provides the following response to the "Reorganized Debtor's Objection to Claim Filed by Cathy Wright, Administratrix, Estate of Nina Wright, dated April 18, 2014 (Objection). In response, claimant makes the following representations:

- 1. Reorganized Debtor Patriot Coal Corp. (Patriot) has identified only two objections. First, Patriot asserts that the Notice of Claim is deficient. *See* Objection at ¶¶ 2, 12, 15, 16. Second, Patriot theorizes that Ms. Wright's manifestation of injury from prior chemical exposure relieves it of any liability for her subsequent 12 years of exposure while working for Eastern. *See Id.* at 14.
 - 2. Both objections are devoid of merit.
- 3. With respect to Ms. Wright's notice, which is attached as Exhibit A, the Bankruptcy Court's instructions state: State the type of debt or how it was incurred. Examples include goods sold, money loaned, services performed, personal injury/wrongful death, car loan, mortgage note and credit card. ... You may be required to provide additional disclosure if an interested party objects to your claim." Exh. A at 3.

Case 12-51502 Doc 5524 Filed 06/06/14 Entered 06/06/14 16:39:03 Main Document Pg 2 of 17

- 4. Ms. Wright correctly identified the basis of the estate's claim as "Personal Injury." See Id. at 1 (box 2). This identification complies with the requirements detailed on the form for the U.S. Bankruptcy Court, Southern District of New York, where the matter was originally filed.
- 5. At no subsequent point has the debtor sought any clarification of the basis of the estate's claim.
- 6. The reorganized debtor, moreover, already possessed the complaint against the company, and, accordingly, the company was fully informed of the facts underlying the personal injury claim.
- 7. Similarly, Patriot's posturing concerning the date of Ms. Wright's injury lacks merit. See Objection at ¶ 14.
- 8. Dr. Nelson Avery conducted a review of Ms. Wright's medical records. A copy of his resulting report is attached as Exhibit B.
- 9. His report notes that Nina Wright was exposed to perchloroethylene (PCE) during her employment at Eastern (an aspect of Patriot Coal) and, with the assistance of another expert, notes her level of exposure to PCE during her ten years working for Eastern. *See* Exh. B at 4.
- 10. That aspect of the report notes that her exposure at Eastern approximately equaled (over far fewer hours) her prior exposure at New River Coal Co. ("New River"), and indicated that the upper end of her exposure to PCE was 90,902,539 mg over the course of her entire employment with Eastern. *Id.*
- 11. Dr. Avery then attributed specific injuries that Ms. Wright suffered to her full exposure to PCE, not simply her initial exposure while working at New River. *Id.* at 8-9.

Case 12-51502 Doc 5524 Filed 06/06/14 Entered 06/06/14 16:39:03 Main Document Pg 3 of 17

12. Accordingly, Patriot is incorrect in its unsubstantiated postulation that Nina

Wright experienced all of her injuries from her exposure to PCE prior to her employment with

Eastern.

13. As Patriot has offered no other objection to the claim beyond these two brief and

superficial challenges, the Court should deny the objection.

14. The Estate maintains that it can meet each aspect of its burden of proof with

respect to its claim against the reorganized debtor and can do so, in part, through other former

Eastern employees and expert testimony.

15. The basis for the amount in the Estate's claim is the total of medical costs, lost

income and pain & suffering attributable to the injuries that Ms. Wright suffered due to her

exposure to PCE while working for Eastern.

WHEREFORE, the Estate of Nina Wright respectfully requests that the Court uphold the

validity of claim and reject the Reorganized Debtor's objections, together with such other and

further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

Dated: June 6, 2014

New York, New York

Respectfully submitted

WEITZ & LUXENBERG

William A. Walsh, Esq.

Admitted Pro Hac VIce

700 Broadway

New York, New York 10003

o. (212) 558-5836

f. (212) 3445461

Counsel to the Estate of Nina Wright

EXHIBIT A

RESPONSE TO THE APRIL 18, 2014 OBJECTION OF THE REORGANIZED DEBTOR TO THE CLAIM OF CATHY WRIGHT, ADMINISTRATRIX FOR THE ESTATE OF NINA WRIGHT

Modified B 10 (GCG) (12-11)

		RUPTCY COURT					
You may only check one Debtor box. If such Debtor.	you have a	claim against multiple	e Debtors listed belo	ow you must	comple	te a separate proof of claim form	for each
Name of Debtor:	Case No.	Name of Debtor:		Case No.	Name	of Debtor:	Case No.
☐ Affinity Mining Company	12-12902	☐ Eastern Royalty,	LLC	12-12936		triot Coal Sales LLC	12-12969
☐ Apogee Coal Company, LLC	12-12903	☐ Emerald Process	ing, L.L.C.	12-12937		triot Coal Services LLC	12-12970
Appalachia Mine Services, LLC	12-12904	Gateway Eagle (Coal Company, LLC			triot Leasing Company LLC	12-12971
Beaver Dam Coal Company, LLC	12-12905 12-12906	☐ Grand Eagle Min ☐ Heritage Coal Co		12-12939 12-12940		triot Midwest Holdings, LLC triot Reserve Holdings, LLC	12-12972 12-12973
☐ Big Eagle, LLC☐ Big Eagle Rail, LLC☐	12-12900	☐ Highland Mining	Company, LLC	12-12941		triot Trading LLC	12-12974
☐ Black Stallion Coal Company, LLC		☐ Hillside Mining		12-12942	🔲 PC	X Enterprises, Inc.	12-12899
☐ Black Walnut Coal Company	12-12909	☐ Hobet Mining, I		12-12943	Pir	ne Ridge Coal Company, LLC	12-12975
☐ Bluegrass Mine Services, LLC	12-12910 12-12911	☐ Indian Hill Com☐ Infinity Coal Sal		12-12944 12-12945		nd Creek Land Resources, LLC nd Fork Processing LLC	12-12976 12-12977
☐ Brook Trout Coal, LLC☐ Catenary Coal Company, LLC☐	12-12911	☐ Interior Holding		12-12946		mington Holdings LLC	12-12978
☐ Central States Coal Reserves of	,	☐ IO Coal LLC	.,	12-12947	□ Re	mington II LLC	12-12979
Kentucky, LLC	12-12914	Jarrell's Branch		12-12948		mington LLC	12-12980
Charles Coal Company, LLC	12-12916	☐ Jupiter Holdings		12-12949 12-12950		vers Edge Mining, Inc. Join Land Company, LLC	12-12981 12-12982
☐ Cleaton Coal Company ☐ Coal Clean LLC	12-12917 12-12918	☐ Kanawha Eagle☐ Kanawha River		12-12951		ntry Mining, LLC	12-12983
☐ Coal Properties, LLC	12-12919	☐ Kanawha River		12-12952	□ Sn	owberry Land Company	12-12984
☐ Coal Reserve Holding Limited		Kanawha River		12-12953		eed Mining LLC	12-12985
Liability Company No. 2	12-12920	☐ KE Ventures, LL ☐ Little Creek LLC		12-12954 12-12955		erling Smokeless Coal ompany, LLC	12-12986
☐ Colony Bay Coal Company☐ Cook Mountain Coal	12-12921	Logan Fork Coa		12-12955		Sales Company, LLC	12-12987
Company, LLC	12-12922	☐ Magnum Coal C		12-12957		e Presidents Energy	
☐ Corydon Resources LLC	12-12923	☐ Magnum Coal S		12-12958		ompany LLC	12-12988
Coventry Mining Services, LLC	12-12924	☐ Martinka Coal C		12-12959 12-12960		underhill Coal LLC out Coal Holdings, LLC	12-12989 12-12990
Coyote Coal Company LLC Cub Branch Coal Company LLC	12-12925 12-12926	☐ Midland Trail En☐ Midwest Coal R		12-12961		nion County Coal Co., LLC	12-12991
Dakota LLC	12-12927	Mountain View	Coal Company, LLO		🔲 Vi	per LLC	12-12992
☐ Day LLC	12-12928	☐ New Trout Coal		12-12963		eatherby Processing LLC	12-12993
☐ Dixon Mining Company, LLC☐ Dodge Hill Holding JV, LLC☐	12-12929 12-12930	☐ Newtown Energ☐ North Page Coa	y, Inc.	12-12964 12-12965		ildeat Energy LLC ildeat, LLC	12-12994 12-12995
Dodge Hill Mining Company, LLC	12-12931	☐ Ohio County Co	al Company, LLC	12-12966		ill Scarlet Properties LLC	12-12996
☐ Dodge Hill of Kentucky, LLC	12-12932	Panther LLC		12-12967	\square W	inchester LLC	12-12997
☐ EACC Camps, Inc.	12-12933		am Holdings, LLC			inifrede Dock Limited Liability	12-12998
☑ Eastern Associated Coal, LLC☑ Eastern Coal Company, LLC	12-12934 12-12935	□ Patriot Coal Cor□ Patriot Coal Cor		12-12968 12-12900		ompany Inkeetown Dock, LLC	12-12999
NOTE: Do not use this form to make a clain request for payment of an administrative exp	ense accordin	g to 11 U.S.C. § 503.	ses after the bankruptc	y filing. You m	ny file a	PROOF OF CLAIM	
Name of Creditor (the person or other entit or property): Cathy Wright, Administratri	•		Check this box to claim amends a p			Your Claim Is Scheduled As I	Follows:
Name and address where notices should be	sent:		Court Claim Numb	2011			
William A. Walsh, Esq.			Court Claim Numi	JCI.			
Weitz & Luxenberg, P.C.							
700 Broadway			(If k	nown)			
New York, NY 10003			Oniginal				
Telephone number: (212) 558-5836			Original Claim				
E-mail: wwalsh@weitzlux.com			Filed on:				
Name and address where payment should b	ne sent (if diff	erent from above):			<u>~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~</u>		
Trunte and training there payment another	, a	.,	Check this box if	you are aware	that	If an amount is identified above,	vou have a
			anyone else has f			claim scheduled by the Debtor as s	shown. (This
·			relating to this cl		py of	scheduled amount of your claim amendment to a previously scheduled	may be an led amount)
Telephone number:			statement giving	particulars.		If you agree with the amount and	d priority of
E-mail:						your claim as scheduled by the Del have no other claim against the De	btor and you btor, you do
1. Amount of Claim as of Date Case I (See instruction #1)	Filed (July 9,	2012): \$ 548,380		-		not need to file this proof of claim CEPT AS FOLLOWS; If the am	n form, EX- lount shown
If all or part of the claim is secured, of	complete item	4.				is listed as DISPUTED, UNLIQU CONTINGENT, a proof of claim	n MUST be
If all or part of the claim is entitled to	priority, com	plete item 5.				filed in order to receive any dis	stribution in
☐ Check this box if the claim include Attach a statement that itemizes in			to the principal amou	nt of the claim		respect of your claim. If you have a proof of claim in accordance with instructions, you need not file again	the attached
Basis for Claim: Personal Injury	Or Orien	J'				The man not the again	
(See instruction #2)						· •	
3. Last four digits of any number by v		13 40 5	Ta. 5			26. 31.10	and the control is
	vhich credito	r identifies Debtor:	3a. Debtor may h	ave schedule	i	3b. Uniform Claim Identifier (o	ptional):
(See instruction #3)		r identifies Debtor:	account as:		i	3b. Uniform Claim Identifier (o	optional):
		r identifies Debtor:	account as: Nina Virginia Wi		.	3b. Uniform Claim Identifier (o (See instruction #3b)	optional):

4.	Secured Claim (See instruction #4) Check the appropriate box if the claim is secured by a lien on property or a right of setoff, attach required redacted documents, and provide the requested information.			Amount of arrearage and other charges, as of the time case was filed, included in secured claim, if any:			
	Nature of prope	erty or right of setoff:	☐ Real Estate ☐ Other	☐ Equipment		\$	
	Describe:			/Manuary 11	Basis for perfection:		
	Value of Proper	rty; \$	_		Amount of Secured Claim:	\$	
	Annual Interes (when case was	t Rate filed)	% □ Fixed or	☐ Variable	Amount Unsecured:	\$	
5,	Amount of Clai	m Entitled to Priority un te the amount. (See instr	der 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a). If action #5)	any part of the clai	n falls into one of the following cat	egories, check the box specifying the	
	☐ Domestic support obligations under 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)(1)(A) or (a)(1)(B). ☐ Up to \$2,600* of deposits toward ☐ Wages, salaries, or commissions (up to \$11,725*) earned within 180 days before the case was filed or the Debtor's business ceased, whichever is earlier —		 □ Contributions to an employee be plan - 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)(5). □ Other - Specify applicable parag 	sgraph			
	purchase, leas	e, or rental of property	11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)(4)		of 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)().		
or services for personal, family, or household use – 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)(7). Taxes or penalties owed to governmental units – 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a)(8).							
	*Amounts are st	ibject to adjustment on 4/1:	13 and every 3 years thered	after with respect to c	cases commenced on or after the date	of adjustment.	
6.	before July 9, 2	t to 11 U.S.C. § 503 (b)(9). 012, the date of commence tation supporting such clai	ement of the above case, it	the amount of your of which the goods h	ave been sold to the Debtor in the o	ods received by the Debtor within 20 days rdinary course of the Debtor's business.	
7,					king this proof of claim. (See instruct		
8.	accounts, contra	ets, judgments, mortgages	of any documents that supp , and security agreements. t are attached. (See instructi	If the claim is secur	ed, box 4 has been completed, and i	invoices, itemized statements of running redacted copies of documents providing	
	DO NOT SEND	ORIGINAL DOCUMEN	TS. ATTACHED DOCUME	ENTS MAY BE DES	TROYED AFTER SCANNING.		
	If the document	s are not available, please e	explain:		- AAAAAAA WATA PORTON TOO TOO		
9,	9. Signature: (See instruction #9) Check the appropriate box.						
	☐ I am the creditor (Attach copy of power of attorney, if any.) ☐ I am the trustee, or the Debtor, or its authorized agent. (See Bankruptcy Rule 3004.) ☐ I am a guarantor, surety, indorser, or other authorized agent. (See Bankruptcy Rule 3005.)						
I declare under penalty of perjury that the information provided in this claim is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information, and reasonable belief. Print Name: William A. Walsh						formation, and reasonable belief.	
	Title:	Associate				12/5/2012	
	Company:	Weitz & Luxenberg, P.0) .		- CONTRACTOR - CON		
		Address and telephone nu 700 Broadway	mber (if different from noti	ce address above):	(Signature)	(Date)	
		New York, NY 10003		Manager			
Tal-	mhona numbow #	240) EE0 E000	e-mail: ususlat @	voitzluv oom			
1616	phone number: (;	∠1∠) 558-583b	e-mail: wwalsh@v		ment for up to 5 years or both 1811	0.0 pe (6) 10571	

Penalty for presenting fraudulent claim: Fine of up to \$500,000 or imprisonment for up to 5 years, or both. 18 U.S.C. §§ 152 and 3571.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PROOF OF CLAIM FORM

The instructions and definitions below are general explanations of the law. In certain circumstances, such as bankruptcy cases not filed voluntarity by the Debtor, exceptions to these general rules may apply. The attorneys for the Debtor and its Court-appointed claims agent, GCG, Inc. ("GCG"), are not authorized to provide you, and are not providing you, with any legal advice.

PLEASÉ SEND YOUR ORIGINAL, COMPLETED CLAIM FORM AS FOLLOWS: IF BY FIRST CLASS MAIL: Patriot Coal Claims Processing Center, c/o GCG, P.O. Box 9898, Dublin, Ohio 43017-5798. IF BY HAND DELIVERY OR OVERNIGHT MAIL: Patriot Coal Claims Processing Center, c/o GCG, 5151 Blazer Parkway, Suite A, Dublin, Ohio 43017. ANY PROOF OF CLAIM SUBMITTED BY FACSIMILE OR EMAIL WILL NOT BE ACCEPTED.

THE GENERAL BAR DATE IS DECEMBER 14, 2012 AT 5:00 P.M. (PREVAILING EASTERN TIME) AND THE GOVERNMENTAL BAR DATE IS JANUARY 21, 2013 AT 5:00 P.M. (PREVAILING EASTERN TIME)

Items to be completed in Proof of Claim Form

Court, Name of Debtor, and Case Number:

These chapter 11 cases were commenced in the United States Bankruptcy Court (the "Court") for the Southern District of New York on July 9, 2012 (the "Commencement Date"). You should select the Debtor against which you are asserting your claim.

A SEPARATE PROOF OF CLAIM FORM MUST BE FILED AGAINST EACH DEBTOR.

Creditor's Name and Address:

Fill in the name of the person or entity asserting a claim and the name and address of the person who should receive notices issued during the bankruptcy cases. Please provide us with a valid e-mail address. A separate space is provided for the payment address if it differs from the notice address. The creditor has a continuing obligation to keep the Court informed of its current address. See Federal Rule of Bankruptcy Procedure (FRBP) 2002(g).

1. Amount of Claim as of Date Case Filed:

State the total amount owed to the creditor on the date of the bankruptcy filing (using the exchange rate, if applicable, as of the Commencement Date.) Follow the instructions concerning whether to complete items 4 and 5. Check the box if interest or other charges are included in the claim.

2. Basis for Claim:

State the type of debt or how it was incurred. Examples include goods sold, money loaned, services performed, personal injury/wrongful death, car loan, mortgage note, and credit card. If the claim is based on delivering health care goods or services, limit the disclosure of the goods or services so as to avoid embarrassment or the disclosure of confidential health care information. You may be required to provide additional disclosure if an interested party objects to your claim.

3. Last Four Digits of Any Number by Which Creditor Identifies Debtor:

State only the last four digits of the Debtor's account or other number used by the creditor to identify the Debtor.

3a. Debtor May Have Scheduled Account As:

Report a change in the creditor's name, a transferred claim, or any other information that clarifies a difference between this proof of claim and the claim as scheduled by the Debtor

3b. Uniform Claim Identifier:

If you use a uniform claim identifier, you may report it here. A uniform claim identifier is an optional 24-character identifier that certain large creditors use to facilitate electronic payment in chapter 13 cases.

4. Secured Claim:

Check whether the claim is fully or partially secured. Skip this section if the claim is entirely unsecured. (See Definitions.) If the claim is secured, check the box for the nature and value of property that secures the claim, attach copies of lien documentation, and state, as of the date of the bankruptcy filing, the annual interest rate (and whether it is fixed or variable), and the amount past due on the claim.

5. Amount of Claim Entitled to Priority Under 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a):

If any portion of the claim falls into any category shown, check the appropriate box(es) and state the amount entitled to priority. (See Definitions.) A claim may be partly priority and partly non-priority. For example, in some of the categories, the law limits the amount entitled to priority.

6, Claim Pursuant to 11 U.S.C. § 503 (b)(9):

If you have a claim arising from the value of any goods received by the Debtor within 20 days before the Commencement Date, in which the goods have been sold to the Debtor in the ordinary course of the Debtor's business, state the amount of such claim and attach documentation supporting such claim. (See Definitions.)

7 Credite

An authorized signature on this proof of claim serves as an acknowledgment that when calculating the amount of the claim, the creditor gave the Debtor credit for any payments received toward the debt.

8. Documents:

Attach redacted copies of any documents that show the debt exists and a lien secures the debt. You must also attach copies of documents that evidence perfection of any security interest. You may also attach a summary in addition to the documents themselves. FRBP 3001(c) and (d). If the claim is based on delivering health care goods or services, limit disclosing confidential health care information. Do not send original documents, as attachments may be destroyed after scanning.

9. Date and Signature:

The individual completing this proof of claim must sign and date it. FRBP 9011. If the claim is filed electronically, FRBP 5005(a)(2) authorizes courts to establish local rules specifying what constitutes a signature. If you sign this form, you declare under penalty of perjury that the information provided is true and correct to the best of your knowledge, information, and reasonable belief. Your signature is also a certification that the claim meets the requirements of FRBP 9011(b). Whether the claim is filed electronically or in person, if your name is on the signature line, you are responsible for the declaration. Print the name and title, if any, of the creditor or other person authorized to file this claim. State the filer's address and telephone number if it differs from the address given on the top of the form for purposes of receiving notices. If the claim is filed by an authorized agent, attach a complete copy of any power of attorney, and provide both the name of the individual filing the claim and the name of the agent. If the authorized agent is a servicer, identify the corporate servicer as the company. Criminal penalties apply for making a false statement on a proof of claim.

DEFINITIONS

Debtor

A debtor is the person, corporation, or other entity that has filed a bankruptcy case.

Creditor

A creditor is the person, corporation, or other entity to whom the debtor owes a debt that was incurred before the date of the bankruptcy filing. See II U.S.C. § 101 (10).

Claim

A claim is the creditor's right to receive payment for a debt owed by the debtor on the date of the bankruptcy filing. See 11 U.S.C. § 101 (5), A claim may be secured or unsecured.

Proof of Claim

A proof of claim is a form used by the creditor to indicate the amount of the debt owed by the debtor on the date of the bankruptcy filing. The creditor must file the proof of claim form with GCG as described in the instructions above.

Secured Claim Under 11 U.S.C. § 506 (a)

A secured claim is one backed by a lien on property of the Debtor. The claim is secured so long as the creditor has the right to be paid from the property prior to other creditors. The amount of the secured claim cannot exceed the value of the property. Any amount owed to the creditor in excess of the value of the property is an unsecured claim. Examples of liens on property include a mortgage on real estate or a security interest in a car. A lien may be voluntarily granted by a debtor or may be obtained through a court proceeding. In some states, a court judgment is a lien. A claim also may be secured if the creditor owes the debtor money (has a right to setoff).

Unsecured Claim

An unsecured claim is one that does not meet the requirements of a secured claim. A claim may be partly unsecured if the amount of the claim exceeds the value of the property on which the creditor has a lien.

Claim Entitled to Priority Under 11 U.S.C. § 507 (a) Priority claims are certain categories of unsecured claims that are paid from the available money or property in a bankruptcy case before other unsecured claims.

Claim Entitled to Priority Under 11 U.S.C. § 503 (b)(9) A Section 503 (b)(9) claim is a claim for the value of any goods received by the Debtor within 20 days before the date of commencement of a bankruptcy case in which the goods have been sold to the Debtor in the ordinary course of such Debtor's business.

Redacted

A document has been redacted when the person filing it has masked, edited out, or otherwise deleted, certain information. A creditor must show only the last four digits of any social security, individual's tax identification, or financial account number, only the initials of a minor's name, and only the year of any person's date of birth. If the claim is based on the delivery of health care goods or services, limit the disclosure of the goods or services so as to avoid embarrassment or the disclosure of confidential health care information.

Evidence of Perfection

Evidence of perfection may include a mortgage, lien, certificate of title, financing statement, or other document showing that the lien has been filed or recorded.

INFORMATION

Acknowledgment of Filing of Claim

Upon GCG's receipt of your proof of claim, GCG will send you an acknowledgement letter stating your assigned claim number and the date on which GCG received your proof of claim. Additionally, you may view your entire filed proof of claim at http://www/patrioteaseinfo.com.

Offers to Purchase a Claim

Certain entities are in the business of purchasing claims for an amount less than the face value of the claims. One or more of these entities may contact the creditor and offer to purchase the claim. Some of the written communications from these entities may easily be confused with official Court documentation or communications from the Debtor. These entities do not represent the Court or the Debtor. The creditor has no obligation to sell its claim. However, if the creditor decides to sell its claim, any transfer of such claim is subject to FRBP 3001(e), any applicable provisions of the Bankruptcy Code (11 U.S.C. § 101 et seq.), and any applicable orders of the Court.

EXHIBIT B

RESPONSE TO THE APRIL 18, 2014 OBJECTION OF THE REORGANIZED DEBTOR TO THE CLAIM OF CATHY WRIGHT, ADMINISTRATRIX FOR THE ESTATE OF NINA WRIGHT



Medical Toxicology Opinion

RE: Nina Wright (deceased) (maiden name: Nina Thompson)
DOB 2/17/1931

SSN ---6073

Wright v. Arkema Inc. Civil Action No. 11-C-5410013

FLOAT-SINK LITIGATION Civil Action No. 11-C-5000000 Hon John A. Hutchison

I am qualified to render the opinions contained herein. I am a fully licensed physician in Texas. I am currently employed at the Texas A&M Health Science Center College of Medicine, where I am a full Professor and Director of the Preventive Medicine Residency Program. I am triple board certified in Medical Toxicology, Occupational Medicine and Internal Medicine, and I have served on the Subboard of Medical Toxicology. From 1996 to 2009, I was a faculty member at the University of Texas Medical Branch in Galveston, where I was jointly appointed in the College of Medicine and the Graduate School of Biomedical Science. I taught toxicology, pharmacology and occupational health. Prior to moving to UTMB, I had 20 years of private practice experience in Austin, Texas, where I was the consulting occupational physician to regional and national companies; I continue as the senior occupational medicine consultant to Freescale Semiconductor (formerly a Motorola division). I have many years of experience regarding treatment and prevention of exposure to solvents. I consult and serve as an expert witness nationally on toxicology issues related to work and the environment.

My opinion is based on a thorough review of my medical history, all available medical records and deposition testimony, and an extensive review of medical literature.

Medical History:

From my questionnaire, supplied by the daughter of the plaintiff Nina Wright:

Her mother died 8/3/2007. She worked for the New River Coal Company from the late 1950s through the late 1960s or early 1970s as a coal analyst, and again for Eastern Assoc. Coal. She was in good health when she was young, except for a hysterectomy. It was in the 1970s when she started having nervous problems and other medical problems that she was treated for by various doctors. She had shingles that left her face scarred. She was later diagnosed with Parkinson's disease, mainly based on how she walked on her toes a lot. Other problems arose and she was told it all related to her disease. She was referred to other hospitals such as Duke

University—they told her all of her problems were due to the Parkinson's. She never had a tremor and her speech was not affected. She did have problems with swallowing. Later in life she became so weak she could not walk but could crawl, which she did quite often. She was on numerous medications and at times over medicated. She hallucinated often, and at one time had severe seizures. It was difficult to find a doctor willing to treat her. A couple of her doctors did not believe she had Parkinson's because of the lack of a tremor. She went to therapy multiple times to improve her mobility, without success. Her medications were frequently changed. She was in a nursing home when she had a choking episode that lead to her death. Her death certificate said she died from Parkinson's.

From her medical records: See listed below under Review of Systems

From the plaintiff fact sheet: [pp 8-9, 13]

- Parkinson's disease—early 1970s
- Nervous breakdown with seizures and hallucinations—early 1970s
- · Shaking, tingling and numbness in limbs
- · Neck muscles were affected
- · Speech was affected

Medications used in past: Daughter said Mrs. Wright's medications were for Parkinson's; too many to remember.

04/2007

Seen in ED with decreased level of consciousness, confused, frequent urination, not eating or drinking, right shoulder pain. Diagnoses: dementia, dehydration. [-0024]

Medications listed at this time [-0029]:

Keppra
Hydrocodone
Seroquel
Comtan
Lorazepam
Razadyne

Carbidopa/levo Phenytoin Sertraline Trimethoprim Protonix

Allergies to medicine: ---

Prior surgery: hysterectomy, cholecystectomy, cataracts

Injuries: none

Social and Family History: Mrs. Wright's husband is alive in a nursing home, 81 years old. Her 8 siblings are deceased, her 2 children are alive. There was a family history of heart disease. No history was supplied on her smoking or drinking alcohol.

Review of systems:

Vision: She wore glasses; had a history of cataracts; used eye medication

Hearing: ---Nose/Throat: ---Heart/Vascular: ---Lungs: ---

Stomach/Liver/Colon: had frequent indigestion, stomach burning; history of gallstones and cholecystectomy

Abdominal 08/1995	pain Gastritis and dysphagia secondary to Parkinsons [-0014]
11/1995	Abdominal pain, intractable change in bowel habits. Underwent colonoscopy: no inflammation, few diverticula. Trial of azulfidine. [-0013, -0018]
10/1996	Had CT scan of abdomen and head; has thrush in throat [-0009]
08/1998 09/1998 09/1998 10/1998 04/1999 07/1999	Abdominal pain for 3 months [-0008] Chronic pancreatitis [-0007] Endoscopy: Erosive gastritis [-0016] Chronic pancreatitis [-0006] Chronic pancreatitis [-0005] Abdominal pain, chronic pancreatitis [-0004]
03/2003	Mid epigastric abdominal pain. Diagnosed as acid peptic disease. [-0003]

Kidney/Bladder/Female: She was told by a physician that because of her Parkinson's she could not empty her bladder, therefore she had a lot of infections; she had urine burning, frequency, dribbling. She had a hysterectomy early in life.

04/2007 BUN: 36 (N= 7-18) [-0038]

Blood/Lymph System/Cancer: ---

Endocrine: ---

Skin: ---

Psychological: She had problems with anxiety, nervousness and depression; she took medications

General: She had problems with weight loss, fatigue, generalized weakness and trouble sleeping

Neurological: No history of head trauma. Had seizures and was told it was secondary to her medications. She had difficulty walking, paresthesias in her extremities, and memory problems—but no tremor.

Senile parkinsonism

03/1997

Neurology consultation: Involuntary jerking of her extremities and gait unsteadiness. Involuntary tremor of her hands and some in her feet. Using a walker and had been falling down. Has sleep impairment. She had previously been diagnosed as having Parkinson's disease and was taking Sinemet and Akineton. She was depressed and nervous. Diagnosis was Parkinson's disease, class III. [-0021]

04/2007

Seen in ED with decreased level of consciousness, confused, frequent urination, not eating or drinking, right shoulder pain. Diagnoses: dementia, dehydration. [-0024] CT brain scan showed atrophic changes and periventricular white matter ischemic changes. [-0031]

Musculoskeletal: ---

Shoulder pain and dehydration episode

04/2007

Seen in ED with decreased level of consciousness, confused, frequent urination, not eating or drinking, right shoulder pain. Diagnoses: dementia, dehydration. [-0024] Right shoulder x-ray: negative [-0032]

Abdominal x-ray: negative; has scoliosis of lumbar spine.

Chest x-ray: normal

BUN: 36 (N= 7-18) [-0038]

Exposure history:

Daughter indicated that Mrs. Wright worked in the coal lab where she crushed the coal into a fine powder—she would look like she worked underground afterwards. She did not know what chemicals she worked with. She did not believe her mother ever worked with safety equipment. She related that she had material on her clothes and laundered them at home. She showered at work. She ate in the workplace.

Environmental History:

She had not lived next to industrial plant or hazardous site; had air conditioning, electric central heating; electric stove; no remodeling or weatherizing; no pesticides used inside; drank water from the city supply

Occupational History: never used a respirator at work.

List from the plaintiff fact sheet [pp 3-4]

- 1956-late 1960s: New River Company. Checked for sulfur, worked with ovens, washed the coal, crushed coal
- 1976-1988: Peabody Coal Company / Eastern Associated Coal Corp.

List of Chemical Exposures: [pp 6-7]

At the coal companies: exposure to perchloroethylene in float-sink work; worked typically 8 hours a day, 40 hours per week.

PPE, as listed in the plaintiff fact sheet [pg 4]

none

Ventilation, as listed in the plaintiff fact sheet [pg 4]

none

Preliminary calculated exposure dose to tetrachloroethylene, by Dr. N.P. Cheremisinoff:

Company:	Hrs/wk Float-sink	Hrs per year	Years empl.	Cumul. hrs.	Min. perc conc. mg/m³ (ppm in parenthesis)	Upper perc conc. mg/m³	Min. perc inhaled in mg	Upper perc inhaled in mg
New River Coal Co.	50	2500	13	32,500	0 (0 ppm)#	2692 (397 ppm)	231	91,862,231
Eastern Assoc. Coal	40	2000	10	20,011	0 (0 ppm)#	4326 (638 ppm)	229	90,902,539
totals						*	460	182,764,770

[#] Revised to 6.8 mg/m³ (1 ppm)

^{*} Revised to 339 mg/m³ (50 ppm) based on minimum value odor threshold

ĺ	Total minimum inhaled (mg):	460
Ì	Total maximum inhaled (mg):	182,764,770

Physical Examination: deceased

Summary of health problems:

- 1. Nervous breakdown, with hallucinations
- 2. Chronic anxiety and depression
- 3. Parkinson disease, but no tremor
- 4. CT brain scan showed atrophic changes plus periventricular white matter ischemic changes (common in elderly with hypertension and atherosclerosis)
- 5. Dysphagia
- 6. Frequent urinary tract infections because of difficulty emptying bladder
- 7. Dementia with decreased memory
- 8. Seizures
- 9. Chronic abdominal pain with chronic pancreatitis (history of gallstones) and erosive gastritis
- 10. Right shoulder pain

Summary of MSDSs

MSDS for perchloroethylene (tetrachloroethylene):

Effects of overexposure: inhalation of vapors may cause headache, nausea, vomiting, dizziness, drowsiness, irritation of respiratory tract, and loss of consciousness. Liquid may be irritating to skin and eyes. Prolonged skin contact may result in dermatitis. Eye contact may result in temporary corneal damage.

Ingestion may cause nausea, vomiting, headaches, dizziness, gastrointestinal irritation.

Chronic effects of overexposure may include damage to kidneys, liver, lungs, blood or central nervous system.

Target organs: liver, kidneys, eyes, upper respiratory system, central nervous system.

Medical conditions generally aggravated by exposure: none identified .

Routes of entry: inhalation, ingestion, eye contact, skin contact.

Different MSDS for perchloroethylene (tetrachloroethylene)

Potential Acute Health Effects:

Hazardous in case of skin contact (irritant), of inhalation. Slightly hazardous in case of skin contact (permeator), of eye contact (irritant), of ingestion.

Potential Chronic Health Effects:

CARCINOGENIC EFFECTS: Classified A3 (Proven for animal.) by ACGIH. Classified 2A (Probable for human.) by IARC; 2 (anticipated carcinogen) by NTP.

MUTAGENIC EFFECTS: Mutagenic for bacteria and/or yeast.

TERATOGENIC EFFECTS: Not available.

DEVELOPMENTAL TOXICITY: Not available.

The substance may be toxic to kidneys, liver, peripheral nervous system, respiratory tract, skin, central nervous system (CNS). Repeated or prolonged exposure to the substance can produce target organs damage.

Another MSDS for perchloroethylene (tetrachloroethylene)

Routes of Exposure: Perchloroethylene can affect the body either through ingestion, inhalation, or contact with the eyes and/or skin.

Summary of Acute Health Hazards

Ingestion: May cause irritation of the gastrointestinal tract with vomiting. If vomiting results in aspiration, chemical pneumonia could follow. Absorption through the gastrointestinal tract may produce symptoms of central nervous system depression ranging from light-headedness to unconsciousness.

Inhalation: Excessive inhalation may produce symptoms of central nervous system depression, ranging from light-headedness, nausea and vomiting, to unconsciousness and death.

Skin: Mildly irritating to the skin. Skin contact may produce a burning sensation. Prolonged or repeated contact may cause skin to become reddened, rough, and dry due to the removal of natural oils and may result in dermatitis.

Eyes: An irritant to the eyes, causing pain, lacrimation, and general inflammation.

Summary of Chronic Health Hazards: Can cause headache, mental confusion, depression, fatigue, loss of appetite, nausea, vomiting, coughing, loss of sense of balance, and visual disturbances. Prolonged or repeated skin contact may cause dermatitis.

Signs and Symptoms of Exposure: N/A

Effects of Overexposure: N/A

Medical Conditions Generally Aggravated by Exposure: Persons with preexisting skin disorders, impaired liver function, or impaired renal function might have increased health risks working with perchloroethylene.

Summary of Literature Review:

Exposure to tetrachloroethylene can affect the

- central nervous system (CNS),
- eyes,
- kidney,
- liver,
- lungs,
- mucous membranes, and
- skin.

CNS effects have been noted most frequently.

Acute health problems related to exposure to tetrachloroethylene:

- CNS effects: confusion, euphoria, forgetfulness, loss of memory, headache, irritability, dizziness, light-headedness, loss of coordination, vestibular dysfunction, reversible mood and behavioral changes, slurred speech, insomnia
- Potential anesthetic effect with drowsiness, and at higher doses, loss of consciousness, seizures
- Irritation of eyes (stinging, burning), corneal damage, conjunctivitis
- Irritation of skin, dermatitis, chemical burns
- Irritation of nose, respiratory tract, cough, non-cardiogenic pulmonary edema
- Nausea, vomiting, diarrhea, anorexia
- · Cardiac dysrhythmia

Chronic Health Hazards:

- Neurological problems:
 - o Headache
 - o Mental confusion, disorientation
 - o Depression, irritability
 - o Fatigue
 - Sleep disturbances, including sleep apnea
 - Concentration impairment, forgetfulness, and short-term memory deficits—can be mistaken for various forms of dementia such as Alzheimer disease or other CNS disorders
 - o Ataxia, loss of sense of balance
 - Delayed reaction times
 - Peripheral neuropathy

Solvent-induced chronic toxic encephalopathy:

CSE patients report memory problems, distractibility and slowness when performing actions, fatigue, irritability and mood lability, sleep problems, and a wide range of neurological and psychosomatic symptoms are prevalent:

- Weakness in extremities
- Trembling of hands
- Decreased sensation, numbness, tingling in extremities
- · Problems with balance, dizziness
- Changes in sense of smell or taste
- Headache
- Sweating for no obvious reason
- Palpitations
- Tinnitus
- · Nausea, stomach pains, diarrhea, constipation, loss of appetite
- · Irritable, depressed, restless, difficulty in controlling anger
- Loss of sexual interest
- Absent minded, difficulty remembering names and dates, forgetfulness
- · Exhaustion, lack of drive, lack of energy
- Falling asleep when not in bed, unusual tiredness
- Nightmares
- Parkinsonism—a relationship between long-term organic solvent exposure and parkinsonism has been proposed by several authors. Cases of parkinsonism have been repeatedly attributed to various hydrocarbons—mainly aliphatic and halogenated compounds. Memory dysfunctions in CSE closely resemble, from the qualitative perspective, memory decline seen in patients with Parkinson's disease. Occupations involving the use of hydrocarbon solvents are a risk factor for the earlier onset of symptoms of PD and more severe disease throughout its course.
- · Loss of appetite, nausea, vomiting
- Coughing
- Visual disturbances: color vision, visuospatial memory
- Prolonged or repeated skin contact may cause dermatitis
- Hepatic: abnormal liver function tests, cirrhosis, hepatitis, hepatomegaly; diffuse parenchymal liver changes seen on ultrasound

- Renal: hematuria, proteinuria, increased levels of lysozymes, β2-microglobulin, and other low-molecular-weight proteins, suggesting tubular damage (mediated through GSH conjugation products)
- Cardiac: arrhythmias, pulmonary edema; decrease the myocardial threshold to the arrhythmogenic effect of epinephrine; cardiomyopathy
- Hematologic: evidence of an effect on red blood cells (decreased hemoglobin), increases in total white cell counts and lymphocyte counts
- Carcinogen, including bladder cancer, non-Hodgkin lymphoma and multiple myeloma; for other sites, including esophageal, kidney, lung, cervical and breast cancer, more limited data suggestive of an effect are available. Based on increased risks of esophageal cancer, cervical cancer, and non-Hodgkin's lymphoma in several epidemiologic studies, and increased liver tumors in mice, increased mononuclear cell leukemia in rats, and renal tumors in male rats, IARC (1995) classified tetrachloroethylene as probably carcinogenic to humans (Group 2A).

Conclusion:

My opinions are based on a thorough review of all available medical records, an extensive review of medical literature, and my own experience, knowledge and training.

In my opinion, to a reasonable degree of medical certainty, Mrs. Wright's exposures to perchloroethylene (routes of exposure by inhalation and dermal absorption) were sufficient to be causally related to her illness:

- · Solvent-induced chronic toxic encephalopathy, with
 - Nervous breakdown
 - Chronic anxiety and depression
 - Dementia
 - Parkinsonism

In my opinion, the following problems either have an uncertain etiology or do not appear to be related to her exposure:

- CT brain scan showed atrophic changes plus periventricular white matter ischemic changes (common in elderly with hypertension and atherosclerosis)
- Dysphagia
- Frequent urinary tract infections because of difficulty emptying bladder
- Saizures
- Chronic abdominal pain with chronic pancreatitis (history of gallstones) and erosive gastritis

This evaluation has been conducted on the basis of the medical documentation as provided with the assumption that the material is true, complete, and correct. It is my understanding that discovery has not been completed yet. If more information becomes available at a later date, then additional service, reports, or reconsideration may be requested. Such information may or may not change the opinions rendered.

Submitted April 13, 2012

A. Nelson Avery, M.D.

a helson averym.

Professor and Director Preventive Medicine Residency Program

Preventive Medicine Residency Program Texas A&M Health Science Center College of Medicine

3950 North A.W. Grimes Blvd. Round Rock, TX 78665-3540